

「謎解きは書評のあとで」

日時：2019年10月5日（土）

会場：立命館大学 大阪いばらきキャンパス

氏名：渡部智也（福岡大学）

1. はじめに—外れた推理

(1) That Barnaby is the son of the murderer may not appear evident to our readers—but we will explain [. . .].

Now, be it observed, it is not the author himself who asserts that *the steward's body was found; he has put the words in the mouth of one of his characters.* His design is to make it appear, in the *denouement*, that the steward, Rudge, first murdered the gardener, then went to his master's chamber, murdered *him*, was interrupted by his (Rudge's) wife, whom he seized and held *by the wrist*, to prevent her giving the alarm—that he then, after possessing himself of the booty desired, returned to the gardener's room, exchanged clothes with him, put upon the corpse his own watch and rings, and secreted it where it was afterwards discovered at so late a period that the features could not be identified. (“The First Review” 219-20, 以下、下線は全て発表者によるものである。)

(2) The elder Rudge himself has probably been only a tool in the hands of Geoffrey Haredale, the brother of the murdered man, and the present incumbent of the Warren estate, which he has inherited upon Reuben's decease. (“The First Review” 221)

2. ポーの謎解き—仮面を剥奪する超人デュパン

(3) “Look down there,” he said softly; “do you mark how they whisper in each other's ears; then dance and leap, to make believe they are in sport? Do you see how they stop for a moment, when they think there is no one looking, and mutter among themselves again; and then how they roll and gambol, delighted with the mischief they've been plotting? Look at 'em now. See how they whirl and plunge. And now they stop again, and whisper, cautiously together—little thinking, mind, how often I have lain upon the grass and watched them. I say—what is it that they plot and hatch? Do you know?”

“They are only clothes,” returned the guest, “such as we wear; hanging on those lines to dry, and fluttering in the wind.” (BR 84)

(4) Now there incoherences are regarded by Mr. Chester simply as such, and no attention is paid them; but they have reference, indistinctly, to the counsellings together of Rudge and Geoffrey Haredale, upon the topic of the bloody deeds committed; which counsellings have been watched by the idiot. In the same manner almost every word spoken by him will be found to have an under

current of meaning, by paying strict attention to which the enjoyment of the imaginative reader will be infinitely heightened. (“The First Review” 222)

(5) Upon perusal of these ravings, we, at once, supposed them to have allusion to some *real* plotting; and even now we cannot force ourselves to believe them not so intended. They suggested the opinion that Haredale himself would be implicated in the murder, and that the counsellings alluded to might be those of that gentleman with Rudge. It is by no means impossible that some such conception wavered in the mind of the author. (“The Second Review” 237-38)

(6) I now looked at the nail. It was as stout as the other, and apparently fitted in the same manner—driven in nearly up to the head [. . .] I touched it; and the head, with about a quarter of an inch of the shank, came off in my fingers. The rest of the shank was in the gimlet-hole, where it had been broken off. The fracture was an old one (for its edges were incrustated with rust), and had apparently been accomplished by the blow of a hammer, which had partially imbedded, in the top of the bottom sash, the head portion of the nail. I now carefully replaced this head portion in the indentation whence I had taken it, and the resemblance to a perfect nail was complete—the fissure was invisible. Pressing the spring, I gently raised the sash for a few inches; the head went up with it, remaining firm in its bed. I closed the window, and the semblance of the whole nail was again perfect. (“Rue Morgue” 158)

(7) さて、ここらでようやく、探偵小説において罫を掛けて引きづりこむ手口そのものの、すなわちこの手口の特徴の話に入る。この特徴は三つの層をなし、相互に密接に関連し、ねらいの的がなかにまんべんなくつまっている。第一に謎解きの緊張がある。これが、さなきだに探偵的なものとして、第二に、往々にしてそこからきわめて重要なものが体験される裏面性という特殊なアクセントをともしつつ、仮面剥奪、すなわち暴露をさし示す。暴露は第三に、事件の物語られなかった部分、物語以前のものからはじめて解き明かされるはずの事件の経過へと立ちいたる。この第三のものが探偵小説のもっとも鮮明な特徴で、これが探偵小説を、探偵とはほとんど無関係にといえるほど、かけがえのないものにするのだ。(ブロッホ 118)

3. ディケンズの謎解き—「単なる」名刑事バケット

(8) Now, Miss Summerson, I'll give you a piece of advice that your husband will find useful when you are happily married and have got a family about you. Whether a person says to you that they are as innocent as can be in all concerning money, look well after your own money, for they are dead certain to collar it, if they can. Whenever a person proclaims to you “In worldly matters I'm a child,” you consider that that person is only a-crying off from being held accountable, and that you have got that person's number, and it's Number One. (BH 704-705)

(9) “Listen then, my angel,” says she, after several sarcastic nods. “You are very spiritual. But can you restore him back to life?”

Mr Bucket answers “Not exactly”

“That is droll. Listen yet one time. You are very spiritual. Can you make a honourable lady of her?”

“Don’t be so malicious,” says Mr Bucket.

“Or a haughty gentleman of *Him*?” cries Mademoiselle, referring to Sir Leicester with ineffable disdain. “Eh! O then regard him! The poor infant! Ha! ha! ha!” (BH 673)

(10) Refreshed by sleep, Mr Bucket rises betimes in the morning, and prepares for a field-day. Smartened up by the aid of a clean shirt and a wet hair-brush, with which instrument, on occasions of ceremony, he lubricates such thin locks as remain to him after his life of severe study, Mr Bucket lays in a breakfast of two mutton chops as a foundation to work upon, together with tea, eggs, toast, and marmalade, on a corresponding scale. (BH 656)

(11) It was a freak of fancy in my friend (for what else shall I call it?) to be enamored of the night for her own sake; [...] At the first dawn of the morning we closed all the massy shutters of our old building; lighted a couple of tapers which, strongly perfumed, threw out only the ghastliest and feeblest of rays. By the aid of these we then busied our souls in dreams—reading, writing, or conversing, until warned by the clock of the advent of the true Darkness. Then we sallied forth into the streets, arm in arm, continuing the topics of the day, or roaming far and wide until a late hour, seeking, amid the wild lights and shadows of the populous city, that infinity of mental excitement which quiet observation can afford. (“Rue Morgue” 144)

4. おわりに—〈簡潔〉対〈冗長〉

(12) The initial consideration was that of extent. If any literary work is too long to be read at one sitting, we must be content to dispense with the immensely important effect derivable from unity of impression—for, if two sittings be required, the affairs of the world interfere, and every thing like totality is at once destroyed. (“The Philosophy of Composition” 15)

(13) Two things are invariably required—first, some amount of complexity, or more properly, adaptation; and secondly, some amount of suggestiveness—some undercurrent, however indefinite of meaning. It is this latter, in especial, which imparts to a work of art so much of that richness [. . .]. (“The Philosophy of Composition” 24)

*謝辞：本発表は JSPS 科研費（JP18K12335）の助成を受けたものです。

Bibliography

- Allen, Hervey. *Israfel: The Life and Times of Edgar Allan Poe*. New York: Farrar & Rinehart, 1934.
- Chesterton, G.K. "A Defence of Detective Stories." 1901. Reprinted in *The Chesterton Review* 37:1/2 (2011): 21-23.
- Daily Mail Reporter. "Charles Dickens novels 'too long' for today's young' says writer's biographer." *Mail Online*. 6 February, 2012. Web.
- Dickens, Charles. *Barnaby Rudge*. Ed. Donald Howes. London: J.M. Dent, 1996.
- . *Bleak House*. Ed. Andrew Sanders. London: J.M. Dent, 1994.
- Grove, Thelma. "Barnaby Rudge: A Case Study in Autism." *The Dickensian* 83:3 (1987): 139-148.
- Murch, A. E. *The Development of the Detective Novel*. New York: Philosophical Library, 1958.
- Ousby, Ian. *Bloodhounds of Heaven: The Detective in English Fiction from Godwin to Doyle*. New York: Harvard University press, 1976.
- Poe, Edgar Allan. "The Murders in the Rue Morgue." *The Complete Tales and Poems of Edgar Allan Poe*. New York: Vintage, 1975, 141-168.
- . "The Mystery of Marie Roget." *The Complete Tales and Poems of Edgar Allan Poe*. New York: Vintage, 1975, 169-207.
- . "The Philosophy of Composition." *Essays and Reviews*. New York: Library of America, 1984, 13-25.
- . "The Purloined Letter." *The Complete Tales and Poems of Edgar Allan Poe*. New York: Vintage, 1975, 208-222.
- . "The First Review of *Barnaby Rudge*." *Essays and Reviews*. New York: Library of America, 1984, 218-224.
- . "The Second Review of *Barnaby Rudge*." *Essays and Reviews*. New York: Library of America, 1984, 224-244.
- Sayers, Dorothy L. "Introduction." *The Omnibus of Crime*. New York: Payson and Clarke, 1929: 9-47.
- Symons, Julian. *Bloody Murder*. Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1974.
- 内田隆三. 『探偵小説の社会学』東京：岩波書店, 2011.
- 江戸川乱歩. 「探偵作家としてのエドガー・ポオ」『ポオ小説全集』第4巻, 東京：東京創元社, 1974, 411-437.
- . 「ディケンズの先鞭」『江戸川乱歩随筆集』紀田順一郎編、東京：筑摩書房, 1994年, 277-286.
- ナルスジャック, ボワロー. 『推理小説論—恐怖と理性の弁証法—』寺門泰彦訳, 東京：紀伊國屋書店、1969年.
- ブロッホ, エルンスト. 「探偵小説の哲学的考察」種村季弘訳. 『推理小説をどう読むか』中田耕治編, 東京：三一書房, 1971年, 113-138.